BOOK REVIEWS


This book is a history of the realisation of the idea of God in human understanding. The aim of the author, who is the Mufti (jurisconsult) of Tripoli in Northern Lebanon, is to convince the modern man—whether Muslim or non-Muslim—that it is only with the help of reason that one can know the meaning of God and existence, whether one seeks Him in Revelation or in Nature. The subject being extremely difficult and involved, the book becomes one of the rare attempts by a Muslim at studying systematically the problem of Faith in God in the light of philosophy, science and the Qur‘ān. In the opinion of the author, the existence of God is the main issue in religion, philosophy and science. The teachings of (conventional) religions do not satisfy the inquisitive mind and there is also a general belief that both philosophy and science are the enemies of Faith—they at least make a man sceptic. The author challenges these assumptions and endeavours to prove that the real and perfect knowledge of God is afforded only by revelation, especially the Qur‘ān, and that this knowledge, created through revelation, is understood only through reason and hence buttressed by philosophy and science. In order to make the recondite and abstruse problems of philosophy easily understandable, the author has very skilfully employed allegory. In the form of an intellectual romance he has cast the Story of Faith (Qīṣṣat al-Īmān). The two main characters of this allegory are an old man named Ḥayrān ibn al-Ad‘af (Bewildered son of the Weakest) and his teacher Abī’l Nūr al-Mawzūn (Father of Light, the Balanced). The names have been carefully and happily chosen. The pupil's name is Ḥayrān (Bewildered) which shows that he is lost in the labyrinth of philosophy and is incapable of achieving the highest exploits of reason. Yet, he is not a dullard, for more than anyone he is keenly conscious of the great problems of Knowledge and Existence; he can and does ask difficult questions of metaphysics and raise awkward objections, and, filled with the spirit of enquiry, wants to put everything to the test of reason. However, with all his intelligence, he is unable to unravel the secrets of Reality and that is why he is 'Bewildered'. In contrast to him, his teacher the Shaykh Abū’l-Nūr (Father of Light) is the person who can dive deep into the innermost recesses of thought and bring out the gems of truth. He is moreover 'Balanced,' is a man of great intellect and a proficient scholar whose opinions about the fundamental problems of Knowledge carry weight and bear the stamp of erudition.

The first chapter of the book is devoted to a study of early Hellenic thought. All the thinkers of this age were confronted with the two main problems of Knowledge and Existence. Many of them reached the idea of one God,—the final cause of all things, but what troubled them most was the origin of the final cause and the creation of the world out of nothing. After much confusion, there appeared the great philosopher—Socrates, who laid the firm foundations of the philosophy of knowledge followed by his pupil Plato, who supported the theory of his master and put it on a firmer footing. Discussing the contribution of Greek
thought to the knowledge of God or what may be called philosophy of God, the Shaykh Abū'l-Nūr here, as also on many other occasions, becomes overzealous to prove the existence of God. His criticism of Plato is rather inappropriate as Plato seldom mentions the idea of God and even this word occurs but rarely in his works. Next, the teachings of Aristotle are critically examined by the Shaykh. It was Aristotle who founded the science of logic and has even been called the First Teacher (al-Mu'allim al-Awwal). The author here attributes certain ideas to Aristotle which he did not champion.

The second chapter treats of the Muslim philosophers, especially al-Fārābī, Ibn Sinā and al-Rāzī. First of all, the Shaykh rejects the popular notion that these great men had little belief in God. He then emphatically asserts that they were among the greatest believers in God and established the best proofs of His existence, for they combined faith in reason with faith in revelation. They were, however, misled by the superstitions of Neoplatonism and its ideas about creation and its different stages (emanation) and mistook all this for the work of Aristotle whom they held in high esteem. Their thought, therefore, contains both truth and falsehood and a serious student of philosophy can distinguish between the two. But the truth they have propounded is of immense value in the history of faith.

According to the author, there are few thinkers as great as al-Fārābī who is most correct and perfect in his argument about the existence of God. He started with the stout defence of reason and laid down its first postulates on which rest its major formulations, and from this he founded his method towards establishing the existence of God. His method was followed seven centuries later by Leibnitz, the great German philosopher.

In the third chapter the Shaykh narrates the story of Hayy ibn Yaqẓān as given by Ibn Ṭufayl, the Spanish philosopher.

The fourth chapter is an admirable exposition of the thought of al-Ghazālī on the issues discussed in this book. The ideas of al-Ghazālī are recounted here in sufficient detail, with a masterly exposition. Here the Shaykh al-Ǧisr also discusses Ibn Rushd’s opposition to al-Ghazālī and expresses the opinion that in principle Ibn Rushd did not differ with his predecessor, and that his antagonism was due to intellectual arrogance rather than to a sincere difference of opinion. He very pungently remarks that Ibn Rushd was unbalanced because his learning was greater than his personality.

In the chapter on Abu'l-'Alā al-Maʿarri, the well-known agnostic, the author has striven to prove that, with all his doubts, al-Maʿarri had faith in the existence of God.

The leading philosophers and thinkers of the West, especially Bacon, Descartes, Spinoza, Kant, Bergson, Darwin, etc., have also been discussed and the author appears to be well informed about them. His exposition of Bacon, Descartes, Pascal and Spinoza and how they have arrived at the idea of God reveals excellent understanding and original thought.

In the next chapter there is a very good study of two great minds of the modern age, Hume and Kant. The author has clearly analysed the irrationality of Hume and has greatly appreciated the logical stand of Kant. Kant, however, thinks that pure reason is not able to penetrate into the essence of things and
establish the existence of God. He, therefore, suggests that man has another reason, known as the "practical reason", meaning thereby the conscience, and with its help argues for the existence of God. He calls the practical reason the moral imperative which is ingrained in our nature exactly as is pure reason. From this moral imperative he argues to the freedom of the will, and from the freedom of the will on to the immortality of the soul and to the Day of Judgment, and from the Day of Judgment to the existence of the great Settler of Accounts, the just Ruler, God. The Shaykh, however, criticises this argument and says that all these arguments from conscience, intuition and elementary reason, only support the findings of pure reason; they do not supersede it. Even the presence of the practical reason itself is discovered only by pure reason.

The eighth chapter is a masterly study devoted to Darwin and Husayn al-Jisr, the father of the author and the writer of al-Risâlah al-Hamidiyyah, in which he proved that nothing in the Darwinian theory of Evolution conflicted with the teachings of Revelation. The theory offered no solution of the fundamental problems of man—the meaning of God, the meaning of existence, and the method of true knowledge. These problems were properly answered only by Revelation. His Risâlah was published in 1888 and soon attained great popularity. The author has quoted extensively from this book to show that it was a great contribution to the contemporary religious and scientific thought. He has also shown that Darwin himself was a firm believer in God and the association of atheism with his discoveries is the work of later speculators.

In the ninth chapter the important verses of the Qur’ân, bearing on the existence of God and the Creation arranged in the chronological order of revelation, are given. This has been done in order to produce in the mind of the reader the same gradual consciousness about these matters which had been experienced by the first addressees of the Qur’ân, at the same time pointing out that none of the philosophic masterpieces can create as much certainty about truth as the message of the Qur’ân. The author also pleads for learning European languages, for most of the philosophy of the world is enshrined in them; moreover, the beauty and truth of the Qur’ân can be fully appreciated only when the latest achievements of philosophy and scientific thought are known.

The next one-third of the book is the Qur’ânic view of the universe. The main theme is that this world is not the outcome of mere chance, but the product of deliberate will and purposeful design. God had created it out of his infinite wisdom and with great beauty and organisation. The Shaykh al-Mawzûn informs his pupil Hayrân that the great Book of Allâh is not this Qur’ân whose words and sentences are limited in number. God Himself says: "Say! if the ocean were ink for writing the words of my Lord, it would dry up before the words could be reduced to writing" (Qur’ân, XVIII: 109). This certainly cannot apply to the limited stock of the words in the Qur’ân. Undoubtedly, the reference is to the "open book" of Nature, wherein even the humblest mind can read the great and innumerable signs of the existence of God. On another occasion God says: "From among His servants it is only the ‘ulamâ’ who fear Him." The ‘ulamâ’ here means those who know the secrets of Existence and the secrets of Creation, and not the traditional theologians. The Shaykh further explains that the Qur’ân does not contain every kind of knowledge as is generally maintained. The Qur’ân
contains only such information as is necessary for the moral guidance of man. There are numerous verses which refer to axiomatic truths lately discovered and explained by science. But the purpose of these verses is to indicate in the creation of this world the signs of will, might, knowledge, wisdom, certainty and balance which point to the existence of God and to deny the emergence of life by mere chance.

The author appears to possess a very good knowledge of contemporary theories in physics, chemistry, biology, mathematics, astronomy and other physical sciences as they affect human thought, as is clear from the way he quotes the verses of the Qur'an relevant to the creation of the heavens and the intricate mechanism of the human body. He treats of space, time and the theory of relativity as one who is conversant with them. But he handles all this knowledge in the light of the Qur'an and argues therefrom that in these great discoveries, to which the Book of God refers again and again, there are the greatest signs of His existence.

The aim of the book is to establish the excellence of Islam in the light of the latest knowledge that man possesses, and to prove that faith in God and in His work as indicated by the Qur'an can stand the highest test of reason. In this mission the author has largely succeeded. He has discussed the most difficult and intricate problems of philosophy and science in a most lucid and elegant style and these discussions are marked by a striking coherence and consistency. The book, as a whole, is a very commendable effort towards telling the story of faith from the Islamic viewpoint and is written in a pleasant but serious style. In fact, it is meant to be read by all intelligent people and not by Muslims alone. The book is not copyright and everyone, who so desires, is free to translate it or otherwise make use of it. The printing and the get-up are both excellent.

KARACHI

QAMARUDDIN KHAN


“Onlookers see more of the game than the players.” In addition to this initial advantage, the Western orientalists are equipped with the tools of the modern knowledge and the techniques of scientific research. They also have access to the source materials and the necessary climate for academic work. These facilities, when properly used, help produce excellent books.

One such book is Islamic Philosophy and Theology. It initiates a series of Islamic Surveys of which Dr. Watt is the General Editor. The Surveys are intended “to extend and deepen the understanding and appreciation of this great segment of mankind, the Muslims.” As explained in the Foreword, the series is “designed to give the educated reader something more than can be found in the usual popular books. Each work undertakes to survey a special part of the field and to show the present stage of scholarship here. Where there is a clear picture, this will be given; but where there are gaps, obscurities and differences of opinion, these will also be indicated”. It will comprise at least fifteen volumes which include important titles: Contemporary Trends in Islam; Islamic Law and Islam in China.
The usefulness of such surveys can hardly be overestimated. They provide books of reasonable size which can give the full range of facts, in proper perspective, and with sound interpretation. Risks are, however, involved. Dr. Watt has the calibre to say so: "Most of the general statements about Islamic philosophy made at present time must be regarded as in part provisional. The scholar who would write about Islamic philosophy is in a dilemma. If he is careful he will hesitate to say anything at all. If he is concerned to try to meet the world's desire to know a little about Islamic philosophy, he will give some account, while knowing that what he says is based on inferior editions." He recognises that his book is open to such criticism.

This book is divided into five parts entitled: "The Umayyad Period"; "The First Wave of Hellenism"; "The Second Wave of Hellenism"; "The Period of Darkness" and "The New Dawn". This emphasis on Hellenism in the early phase has been rather overplayed. Like very progressive people, the Muslims took advantage of all that was available. Iranians probably contributed as much to the intellectual equipment of the Muslims. Apart from this bias, there is another viewpoint which considerably influences the book. The author clearly states that the survey has been written with the assumption that all theological and philosophical ideas have a political or social reference. Special efforts have, therefore, throughout been made to bring out political or social factors which led to the evolution of various sects and theological controversies. In places, this has resulted in overemphasis.

In matters of detail and socio-historical explanations of certain phenomena in Islam, however, many people will differ from the conclusions of Dr. Watt. His account of the genesis of the Shi'ite and Kharijite sects affords a pertinent illustration. While explaining the Shi'ite belief in an infallible, "charismatic" leader, Dr. Watt says that for the Shi'ah, the old Arab belief that special qualities of character were handed down in certain families justified them in taking "Ali as a leader of infallible wisdom" (p. 5). Now, where is the requisite evidence for this fantastic assertion about the Arabs? When did the Arabs believe in the infallible wisdom of the leader? The Arabs undoubtedly believed in certain qualities like generosity, manliness, wisdom and others. But these are acquired human qualities. When an Arab speaks of these qualities as belonging to a noble house, he means no more than the fact that a family which is high and influential is more likely to breed good men than an ordinary family. Indeed, the Arab is even actually aware that this is not a universal law. For the rest, many Arabs believed in soothsayers (Kāhīns) but a soothsayer's qualities were hardly hereditary. Obviously, Dr. Watt has given primacy to a theological position, whereas what has actually happened is that a certain politico-moral attitude was taken up by a group, which was later given a theological base (on the basis of certain old Iranian concepts) which was, in turn, projected back to the contemporaries of 'Ali. The same, mutatis mutandis, must apply to the Kharijī position.

Keeping these limitations in mind, the book provides informative and useful reading. It gives flashes of insight into Muslim history, intellectual as well as political. For an average reader, the book provides a very rewarding reading. It opens up the entire panorama of Islamic philosophy and theology. Accounts are brief but penetrating. There is a bias or rather a preference for certain
approaches. An allowance has to be made for this fact. A clearer perspective emerges if this book is supplemented by a reading of H. A. R. Gibb's Mohammedanism.

Part V is extremely important. Dr. Watt considers that the impact of Europe on the Muslim world might prove the Third Wave of Hellenism. He remarks: "What is needed is a set of ideas which is both a development of traditional theological conceptions and also relevant to contemporary problems and this relevance must go hand in hand" (p. 175).

Referring to the contemporary challenge to the great religions, Dr. Watt writes: "There are strong pressures urging men towards a unified world religion. Ideally, all that is of value in the several religions should be taken up into one religion; but it is possible that to begin with, humanity may fall far short of this ideal and in this way much of value may be lost. The new problem of Islamic theologians, as for those of all the religions (including Christianity) is to present what they see of value in their religions in such a form that it is capable of being assimilated by others. The present survey has been written from the standpoint that there is much of value in Islam and it would thus be a loss for the whole world if what is valuable is not transmuted and sublimated and so made suitable for inclusion in the unified religion for the whole world" (p. 178).

To this challenge, Muslims have to respond; and they must try to transmute and sublimate all they consider is of value in Islam.

Such books as the present one may help create consciousness among the Muslims about the critical times through which they are passing. It is the result of serious study and thought and has set a high standard for the series. For the non-Muslim reader, it is no doubt useful; but for the Muslim reader, it has an important message. It helps him develop the historical sense which is so necessary for an appreciation of what happened to Islam. It enables him to see in proper perspective the development in Islam in which he is wholly involved. This book is a welcome and a valuable addition to the literature on Islam.

KARACHI

ASLAM SIDDIQI


Although published thirteen years ago, this book by Prof. Ugo Monneret de Villard is still considered to be one of the best works on the subject of Muslim Art. A splendidly illustrated publication, it deals with a matter which was practically ignored because of the difficulty experienced by scholars and art historians in acquiring suitable reproductions and designs from the Muslim paintings of the Cappella Palatina.

Prof. Monneret de Villard has divided his work into seven chapters with over 300 notes. There are also 250 black and white illustrations taken from the same ceiling.

The first chapter describes in outline the history of Muslim monumental painting up to the Faṭimid period. The author mentions the scarcity of documents and relics of the Faṭimid period in Egypt. This is why this only complete cycle
of Muslim painting giving us a definite date, i.e. the paintings on the ceiling of the Palatina Chapel, are so very important to us.

In the second chapter Prof. Monneret de Villard provides small but important information concerning the Norman king, Roger the Second. For it was in his reign that the Palatina Chapel was built. Roger the Second found that in Sicily there were two great traditions, the Byzantine and the Muslim. And subsequently he tried to create a balance between the two. This period is sometimes referred to as the cosmopolitan period in Sicily. And one example of its effect can be observed in the quadrilingual inscription in Latin, Greek, Hebrew and Arabic, which is nowadays housed in the National Museum in Palermo.

The third chapter deals with the historic data of the Chapel and lists the various Latin inscriptions which were laid down at the time of the foundation of the Chapel and during restoration work done to it. The Chapel, right in the centre of the Palermo Palace of the Norman kings, was constructed in the beginning of the 12th century. The restoration work of the ceiling in the central nave started in 1478, under King John, and continued under Ferdinand the Catholic. Probably some more restoration work was done in 1798, when, for the first time, the Arabic inscriptions on the rosaces could be read.

The rest of the chapters discuss the technical structure of the ceiling, the decoration work, the iconography, and the style.

The author compares the technical structure of two other famous ceilings—one of the mosque in Cordova and the other of the mosque at al-Qayruwân—which both belong to an earlier period than the Chapel. And he comes to the conclusion that there is no connection whatsoever between the two ceilings of these mosques and the ceiling of the Palatina Chapel.

After examining still other examples Prof. Monneret de Villard remarks that there is no doubt that the Islamic motifs in the Chapel of Palermo were brought to Sicily from the East rather than from North Africa—as one would expect.

As regards the inscriptions, which were studied by Michele Amari, the explanation is more complicated and difficult. First, one must state that they have proved to be nothing more than a series of words without any specific meaning or connection with each other. Though these inscriptions are about three hundred in number, they actually contain, in all, just thirty words, among which there are certain recurring words such as “wealth”, “power”, “happiness” etc.” These inscriptions are divided by Prof. Monneret de Villard into four groups each having different characteristics, although they belong to the same period of construction and decoration in the Chapel (1132-1143 A.C.). Hence it would seem that four separate groups of artists, who came with different backgrounds and traditions, worked in the Palatina Chapel, all at the same time. Anyway this supposition, when proved, will be of great importance to the artistic history of the Chapel.

Concerning the iconography it must be noted that the scenes which form the most important part of the paintings on the ceiling of the Chapel do not follow in regular succession to each other. Each scene must be taken by itself, and this makes the author believe that the whole work was for a purely decorative purpose.
The artists who worked on these paintings gave preference to the painting of animals, and particularly birds. And this was done in accordance with the tradition of Samarra and Egyptian ceramics, as well as Egyptian textiles. Ducks and peacocks occupy a prominent place. In order to explain this preference it is enough to recall the Palace of the Peacocks, in Baghdad, the peacock sculptured in a pluteus of St. Mark's, in Venice, and in Spain the peacocks painted on many examples of ivory work. The motifs taken from the vegetable kingdom include the recurring design of the palm tree.

Regarding the scenes from life, reproduced many times over, is the scene of a man about to drink from a cup, and for his pleasure these follow scenes of musicians, along with scenes of dancing girls, and fighting scenes.

The author ends his very interesting and lucid description of the various motifs, by suggesting that a great number of these scenes could be an idealization of the "cycle in the daily life of the gentleman," which was probably a popular theme used in Islamic art during the 10th and the 12th centuries. While considering the mythical scenes and the depictions of mythical animals, one can realize that the paintings in the Chapel do not belong to the Fatimid art alone but also to the 'Abbāsid and the Mesopotamian art.

Hence the mystery of the provenance of the artists who worked in the Chapel will not be easy to solve through iconographic analysis. But, on the other hand, what appears to be quite clear from this huge cycle of paintings is that from the 12th century the purely decorative aim of Islamic art began to be substituted by an artistic aspect where the third dimension was also shown. Old fixed ideas were abandoned, and the reality of daily life was brought out.

KARACHI

VITO SALIERNO


This is an excellent study of the political thought of the Young Ottomans, the Turkish intellectuals who were influential literary figures during the late Tanzimat period, from 1867 until 1878, and the forerunners of the Young Turks. The author is a Turk who was until recently a Research Fellow at the Universities of Princeton and Harvard. There are a number of works in Turkish on the subject, but these are lacking in objectivity and scholarly presentation. The present study is an attempt to probe into the early phase of the Westernization movement in Turkey and the ideas of the first generation of the Westernized elite who prepared the ground for constitutionalism and the Young Turk Revolution.

The importance of the subject can better be described in the words of the author: "There is hardly a single area of modernization in Turkey today, from the simplification of the written language to the idea of fundamental civil liberties, that does not take its roots in the pioneering work of the Young Ottomans. Paradoxically, any serious attempt to re-inject Islam into the foundations of the Turkish state, were it to appear today, would also have to look back to their time. This is so because the Young Ottomans were at one and the same time the first men to make the ideas of the Enlightenment part of the intellectual equipment of the Turkish reading public and the first thinkers to try to work out a synthesis between these ideas and Islam" (pp. 3-4).
The study consists of two major sections, the first being an analytical background of the formation of the Young Ottoman ideas, the second containing an analysis of the political ideas of each of the eminent figures of the Young Ottoman movement.

Men like Shinasi, Ali Suavi, Namik Kemal and Ziya Pasha whose political ideas are discussed in this study were not outstanding philosophers or scholars, yet their thought is of great importance. "It was an expression of the political beliefs of the earliest modern Turkish intelligentsia. The Islamic-scholastic side of the education of these men provided them with a discipline of mind which should not be underestimated. The political writings of Namik Kemal, for example, surpass, in their compactness and clarity, many more recent Turkish writings on politics" (p. 9).

Chapter II contains a discussion of the causes of the formation of the Young Ottoman's society in 1865. The author has explained the factors that contributed to the prevailing chaos between 1856 and 1865 and the reasons behind the Turkish policy of reform, in a cogent manner. This is a topic which is very often confused by Turkish and Western scholars by stressing some aspects of the Western reforms that must be explained by a simpler explanation of the relationship between causes and effects. The author has admirably produced an objective survey of the events in a balanced manner throwing into sharp relief the grievances that led to the formation of the Ottoman society later known as Young Ottomans or New Ottomans.

The Islamic intellectual heritage of the Young Ottomans is discussed in Chapter III which includes the political theology of Islam, political obligation, the Islamic view of natural law, the political theory of the Muslim philosophers—al-Fārābī, Ibn Sīnā and al-Dawwānī, the theory of justice and the philosopher-king, and the secular and religious laws amongst the Seljuqs and the Mongols.

In this chapter, various strands of Islamic and Turco-Mongol political theory have been woven together in order to show the cultural background of the Young Ottomans. Mentioning the political theology of Islam, the author remarks: "In theory, therefore, Islam is the direct government of Allāh, the rule of God, whose eyes are upon His people. The principle of Unity and Order which in other societies is called civitas, polis, capital, in Islam is personified by Allāh: Allāh is the name of the Supreme Power acting in the common interest. Thus the public treasury is the 'treasury of Allāh', the Army is the 'army of Allāh', even public functionaries are 'the employees of Allāh'" (pp. 82ff). The author quotes the above lines from an article by David de Santillana entitled "Law and Society", in The Legacy of Islam (ed. T. W. Arnold and Alfred Guillaume), London, Oxford University Press, 1931.

In presenting the above views of a Western orientalist, the author seems to have ignored the true Islamic version of the political theory of Islam. Let us suppose that there has not been a political theory in Islam in the sense that this term is understood in the Western world, at least there has been some operative political theory in the Muslim world. Al-Mawardi's al-Āhkām al-Sulṭāniyyah and Nizām al-Mulk's Siyāsāt-Šāmah are well-known works on the Islamic political theory, besides a number of other works by Muslim scholars. The basic mistake of the Western scholars discussing the idea of an Islamic state is their
use of the word 'Theocracy' which means the rule of God, in Christian
terminology. A Muslim scholar relying too much on Western sources has to
face such difficulties. The author would have done well had he referred to some
well-known Muslim writer on the subject.

The author's treatment of the Islamic intellectual heritage of the Young
Ottomans seems to be lacking in detail, particularly the Pan-Islamic ideas that
they espoused. This is a feature of most of the books written on the Westerniza-
tion movements in Turkey. Most of the modern Turkish writers have singularly
ignored the background of the Pan-Islamic groups and societies and their
programmes in their description of the reform movements in the Ottoman Empire.

After dealing with the background of the Young Ottomans, the author has
examined the political ideas of the eminent members of the movement in
different chapters. On the whole, the author has presented a well-documented
and balanced evaluation of the Young Ottomans. The movement was exhausted
soon on account of the political changes taking place in the Ottoman Empire, and
its members encountered a series of disillusionments. Their contribution was
"the establishment of a climate of opinion wherein discussions centered around
such conceptions as that of 'liberty' and 'the fatherland' became widespread and
gained increased momentum despite Abdülhamid's censorship. This was no mean
intellectual legacy" (p. 80).

The book fills a long-felt gap on the subject for English readers. It is useful
for the scholar and the student as well as for the average reader of Turkish
history. It provides a link in the development of the Islamic political theory,
and can, therefore, be recommended to the political scientist as well.

KARACHI

MUHAMMAD RASHID FEROZE

Books Received

1. T. B. Irving, THE FALCON OF SPAIN, Sh. Muhammad Ashraf, Kashmiri
   Bazar, Lahore, 1962, pp. 203, price Rs. 7.50.
2. Abbas Hamdani, THE FATIMIDS, Pakistan Publishing House, Pakistan
   Chowk, Karachi, pp. 80, price Rs. 4.00.